

Island of Hawai'i

Summary of Public Survey on Size & Bag Limit

Proposed Rule Amendments

December 2009

In January of 2009 DAR embarked on a statewide effort to update its nearshore fishing regulations. Initial emphasis was directed on establishing minimum sizes for at least three priority families of fishes (goatfishes, parrotfishes and jacks). Based on past input from the fisher and ocean user communities it was clear that the public dialog on these issues needed to be expanded to include other species of concern and additional management options besides minimum sizes. This document provides an overview of the community driven process on the Big Island to reach consensus on general and species-specific management proposals.

ROUND I. A series of six public meetings were held in various Big Island locations from January 15, 2009 to April 28, 2009. Over 150 people attended these meetings which were widely publicized by means of DLNR press releases, radio and newspaper notices, email distribution lists and through the West Hawai'i Fisheries Council. A number of community members were instrumental in assisting with the meetings including, but not limited to, Leonard Torricer, Sara Peck (Sea Grant) and Dr. Craig Severance (UH Hilo). The following is the DLNR press release on the first of the Hawai'i meetings:

For Immediate Release: January 12, 2009

DLNR TO HOLD PUBLIC INFORMATION MEETINGS TO DISCUSS POSSIBLE REGULATIONS FOR CERTAIN MARINE FISH

HONOLULU – The Department of Land and Natural Resources (DLNR) invites the public to participate in informational meetings to discuss possible regulations for certain marine fish species.

The public discussion will center on using minimum size rules to protect harvested resource fish that may be at risk of being over harvested, and will focus on at least three main fish families that the DLNR feels may be in need of updated regulations. They are: Parrotfish (*uhu*), Goatfish (*weke*), and Jacks (*ulua/papio*). The Division of Aquatic Resources has not yet drafted rule changes.

In addition to the meetings announced last week (January 9), a Hilo and Kona meeting have been added. The schedule of meetings is:

Maui -- January 14 (Wednesday), from 5:30 to 8:30 p.m. at the Maui Waena Elementary School cafeteria, 795 Onehe'e Avenue in Kahului.

Kona – January 15 (Thursday), from 6:30 to 8:30 p.m. at the monthly meeting of the West Hawai‘i Fisheries Council, at the Honokohau Big Game Fishing Club, Honokohau Small Boat Harbor, 74-380 Kealakehe Parkway, Kailua-Kona.

Hilo – January 27 (Tuesday) from 6 to 8:30 p.m. at the County of Hawai‘i Aupuni conference room at 101 Pauahi St.

Kaua'i -- January 30 (Friday), from 6 to 8:30 p.m. at the Kaua‘i Community College, Electronics Technology building, room 114.

“We are holding these public information meetings to listen to concerns and suggestions from the public regarding fishing and protection of these three species,” said Laura H. Thielen, DLNR Chairperson. “The input we receive from the public will help the Division of Aquatic Resources design rules that will support the ongoing conservation of our marine resources while balancing the needs of recreational, subsistence and commercial fishers.”

Recreational and subsistence fishers have developed a preference for the parrotfish family (also known as *uhu*), with many spearfishers considering them prized catches.

Commercial harvesting of *uhu* has also increased, with commercial fishers now supplying *uhu* to various markets throughout the state. Recent changes in *uhu* commercial harvesting using specialized and highly effective net- and trap-based fisheries operating in deeper water can remove large amounts of *uhu*.

These trends have resulted in increased concern over *uhu* stocks.

Of particular concern is the role of these fish in helping to maintain healthy coral reefs. Parrotfish, the largest grazing fishes on Hawai‘i’s reefs, play a critical role in controlling seaweed growth and thereby help to maintain healthy coral reef ecosystems.

Scientific information from commercial fisheries and fish survey data for goatfishes (*moano kali* and *weke nono*) show a decline in catch rate over time that correlates with an observed decrease in goatfish abundance.

Ulua/papio is another very important species caught by recreational fishers.

The Division of Aquatic Resources plans to hold similar meetings on other islands, and those dates and locations will be announced at a later time.

For more information contact DAR offices at: Maui (808) 243-5294; Hawai‘i (808) 974-6201, Kaua‘i (808) 274-3344; Honolulu (808) 587-0100; Moloka‘i/Lana‘i (808) 567-3778.

#

For more information news media may contact:

Deborah Ward

DLNR Public information specialist

Phone: (808) 587-0320

The public meetings were structured around an initial DAR PowerPoint presentation which documented the need for proactive management of our coral reef fish populations. Historical references, commercial landing trends, comparative underwater studies and fisher surveys were presented to document declining resources and suggest various management approaches to ensure sustainable fisheries and healthy coral reefs. This PowerPoint presentation is available on the DAR website: <http://hawaii.gov/dlnr/dar/>.

In conjunction with the information provided in the meeting presentation a questionnaire was also developed for West Hawaii meetings to help gauge public sentiment on a number of strategic management questions. After the presentation small break out groups were directed to discuss and respond to the items on the questionnaire. Individuals could also access and fill out the questionnaire online (on Malama Kai website and a dedicated 'survey monkey' web site). An extensive table presenting information on maximum size, L50 and current size rules for a wide variety of food fish species was made available at the meetings to assist people in their discussions and a number of visual aids were also provided to help people visualize fish sizes.

ROUND II. Subsequent to the first round of public meetings DAR staff members from all islands convened a two day forum (May 11 & 12, 2009) in Honolulu to assess the public input and to strategize the next course of action. In terms of the next steps it was proposed that the results of the first round of public meetings and surveys would be posted on the DAR website for public consumption by May 31, 2009. A second round of public meetings was also scheduled to present the proposed combination of species-specific size and bag limits developed by staff at the DAR forum. At these meetings the core policy consensus that DAR would like to apply statewide would be presented, with local modifications for individual districts as appropriate. The target deadline for holding this second round of meetings was June 20, 2009.

Four public meetings were held in West Hawai'i from May 21- June 17, 2009 and 5 meetings were held in East Hawai'i from May 19 –June 22, 2009. As before, considerable effort was put into publicizing the meetings. Over 230 people attended these meetings.

In conjunction with the second round of meetings another questionnaire was developed to solicit public response. In contrast to the 10 general questions presented in the first questionnaire the second was very detailed and species-specific. Almost three dozen changes to existing size and bag limits were proposed. These rule changes were proposed based on DAR staff discussions at the May forum.

Below is an information sheet that was provided to accompany the questionnaire. As with the first questionnaire this one could also be accessed and completed online (Google Survey).

Updates to Hawai'i's Fishing Regulations

The following questionnaire is designed to accurately gather your input on several proposed updates to Hawai'i's fishing regulations. These proposals were developed in response to five public meetings held earlier this year and individual responses to a previous questionnaire. DAR is using this questionnaire to gather more specific and detailed comments from the public with the goal of creating fishing rules that will be understood and widely supported by the West Hawai'i community.

Three priority fish family groups were identified as initial candidates for updated fishing rules. These include goatfishes, parrotfishes (uhu) and jacks (ulua/papio). These groups were prioritized based on available scientific evidence as well as concerns from the public. Commercial catch reports and underwater surveys suggest that large species of goatfish (e.g. kumu, moano kali, weke nono and munu) are in need of better protection. In water fish counts also show substantial declines in uhu stocks in many areas of the state with healthy populations found only in marine reserves or inaccessible and remote coastal areas (& West Hawai'i). Evidence from all over the world also suggests that herbivores such as parrotfish play a critically important role in maintaining healthy coral reef ecosystems. With many of Hawai'i's coral reefs experiencing decreasing coral cover and increasing problems with invasive seaweeds, better uhu regulations are urgent. The papio and ulua group of fish make up an extremely popular nearshore sports fishery. It is therefore prudent for the state to manage this recreational fishery with great care. Recent changes in bottomfish regulations along with shifting market trends are beginning to place more commercial pressure on the ulua fish stocks. The proposed regulations for the jacks are designed to maintain and improve recreational shoreline fishing opportunities.

Additional species changes were the direct result of public concerns that were voiced at the meetings in early 2009. In some cases, it was felt that creating new bag limit regulations would allow the removal of existing minimum size regulations. For example, many people like to catch small aholehole for use as bait, etc. Current rules prohibit the harvest of any aholehole below 5" in fork length. With the addition of a bag limit, DAR staff felt it would be appropriate to remove the 5" minimum size limit and allow small fish to be taken given that excessive harvest would be prevented by the bag limit.

Please take some time to think about these proposed rules and to provide thoughtful comments. Any new fishing rule will mean that what some of us are used to doing will no longer be legally allowed. However, without making some sacrifices it is likely that fish populations and overall ecosystem health will continue to decline. We hope that by working together the DAR can create smart, easy to understand rules that everyone can support. We need your help to ensure that we will always have fish for the future.

For more information, please contact DAR

The following table summarizes the public responses and comments to the survey on proposed fishing rule recommendations. A total of 248 surveys were completed on the Island of Hawai'i.

Island of Hawai'i

Summary of Public Survey on Size & Bag Limit Rule Recommendations

N = 85 for West Hawai'i N = 163 for East Hawai'i

Note: % may not total 100% due to blanks

Goatfish Regulations

Goatfish Species	Max Size	L ₅₀	Existing Rule	Proposed Rule	% Agree	% Disagree
<i>Minimum Sizes</i>						
Kumu (<i>P. porphyreus</i>)	17.9"	10.4"-11.3"	10"	12"	56	33
Moano Kali (<i>P. cyclostomus</i>)	17.3"	11.4"	-	12"	57	28
Weke nono (<i>M. pflugeri</i>)	17.1"	10.3"	-	12"	52	38
Munu (<i>P. insularis</i>)	14.2"	7.5"	-	8"	58	32
Other goatfish (not weke pueo)	10.5"-14.4"	6.6"-7.9"	7"	8"	47	35
<i>Bag Limits</i>						
Kumu (<i>P. porphyreus</i>)			-	2	48	42
Moano Kali (<i>P. cyclostomus</i>)			-	2	48	40
Weke nono (<i>M. pflugeri</i>)			-	5	39	33
Munu (<i>P. insularis</i>)			-	2	42	46
'Oama (= weke ≤5")			50	50 - Pole & Line Only	57	47
<i>Other</i>						
5 year moratorium no-take moratorium on Kumu					26	25

Additional comments on these proposed goatfish regulations:

- I would opt for the 5 year moratorium on kumu instead of a bag limit of 2
- 5 year moratorium on kumu – only for Oahu
- Yes, yes, yes to 5 year moratorium
- 5 yr moratorium on kumu
- 5 year no- take on kumu- too long
- No 5yr. moratorium, too long. Make periods throughout the year

- Bag limit on kumu, moano kali, munu – 4
- Kumu and Munu bag limit should be 4 daily/person.
- Kumu bag limit to one
- Weke nono bag limit should be 2 rather than 5
- Maybe oama bag limit should be less than 50/day
- Bag limit on oama should be less
- Bag limit for oama should be 30 not 50
- Change oama bag limit to 30
- Oama bag limit to 25 per day/person
- Oama bag limit of 25/day or 50/week
- Lower Oama daily bag limit to 15-20 per person
- Change weke nono bag limit to 2 for consistency
- The bag limits will conserve the resource due to reduction of commercial pressure
- The 12'' fl is too long for a majority of recreational users. Kumu, moano kali and weke nono should have 10'' fl min. size and munu and all other goatfish have 7'' fl size, with the proposed bag limit
- Munu minimum size to 10'' and commercial bag limit five per person/day
- Leave kumu minimum size at 10'' – have all goatfish minimum size @ 10'' for consistency
- Size limits for goatfish should be larger
- From shore it's really hard to catch the size limit. People also like to use weke as bait. The bag limit would be hard to feed my family. Also catch half-breeds (kumu/moano, kumu/weke nono) would they be other?
- Keep current rules, no need new ones
- L50 isn't viable, as many of these species are targeted by spearfishermen - it's hard to estimate size of a fish before you spear it, and it's hard to release a fish that you have run through with a spear. And no-one remembers what the size limits are, and there are lots of different species
- If best reproduction is at a certain size then there should be regulations of taking fish that size because reproduction is the only way to ensure survival of that species
- What about weke ula (*M. vanicolensis*)? One school can be caught in a net and there goes an entire local population. Legal size limit for this species is good, but a bag limit is needed – 5/day
- I bottom fish for home consumption for myself and immediate family on the Windward side of the Big Island. Weather permitting I fish 1-2 times a week using my boat. All these size increases seem reasonable to me based on my catch experience.

- I have attended numerous meetings over the past years regarding this subject here and on mainland and read studies from New Zealand and Australia. The science is there just have the DLNR set the laws and let's monitor their effect on a yearly basis to show everyone that these regulations work
- Take juveniles, not breeding adults
- Goatfish have been grossly overfished. Need to be big reductions in bag limits and increased take sizes as proposed
- All bag minimum size should be smaller and bag limits less
- Change minimum size wording to maximum size
- I agree with all these rules for goat fish family except in areas of Ka'u and Hamakua because of the abundances of goat fish in these areas. They should have a bag limit but increase it and keep minimum size
- Make seasons on goatfishes.
- Make monthly seasons on goatfishes
- Every other year seasons on no take of goatfishes
- Taape eat the food for weke

Parrotfish (Uhu) regulations

Parrotfish Species	Max Size	L ₅₀	Existing Rule	Proposed Rule	% Agree	% Disagree
<i>Minimum Sizes</i>						
Palukaluka (<i>S. rubroviolaceus</i>)	27.6"	14"	12"	14"	56	31
Uhu uliuli (<i>C. perspicillatus</i>)	26"	14"	12"	14"	54	30
All other species	11.8"-19.7"	6"-12"	12"	10"	51	31
<i>Bag Limits</i>						
All species			-	2 (Total)	44	41
Palukaluka (<i>S. rubroviolaceus</i>)			-	No take of Blue males	36	37
Uhu uliuli (<i>C. perspicillatus</i>)			-	No take of Blue males	35	37
All other species			-	1 Blue male	37	43

Additional comments on these proposed uhu regulations:

- The 12'' current fl for uhu is sufficient, as long as the bag limit of 2 is adhered to. This bag limit will curb commercial and nighttime over-exploitation of these resources
- Leave minimum size at 12'' for all parrot fish
- Minimum size for All other species of parrotfishes should be 12'' and not 10''
- Don't decrease size limit for "All other species". Leave as is
- I don't fish for uhu but larger size limits still seem reasonable
- Size limits shouldn't apply to recreational and sustenance fishers
- Need maximum size limit on take
- Larger min. size limits to 16'' or 18'' with bag limit increase to 3 or 4
- No bag limits. Regulation should be based on L50
- Have a bag limit of 2 parrot fish of any type per day
- Bag limits on blue males all species- 3
- All species a weekly bag limit of 2 per species
- Bag limit of four
- All species bag limit to 5
- Bag limits too low
- I agree with all proposed bag limits
- No take any of all parrotfish species
- Parrot fish are extremely important herbivores and help west Hawai'i to stay free of invasives and macro-algae blooms. No-take at all is better and although I don't know what a blue male is, for the species I suggest no take as well so enforcement is easier. As the L50 is 6-12'' I disagree with the proposed rule of 10'', why not at least 12'. For the other two species, I would suggest 16'' to give some more parrots a chance to reproduce.
- Uhu uliuli – no take
- Should be no-take for all Uhu uliuli instead of proposed size limit
- Consider moratorium on uhu
- Need make clear the reason why take of blue males is significant
- I disagree with prohibiting the take of blue males. This will increase pressure on the female (egg laying) uhu and be detrimental to the resource. Furthermore, uhu have the ability to change sex from female to male, so the alpha female can change to a male to take over the harem. There should be a ban on taking

large female uhu over a certain size. This will ensure an abundance of egg bearing females with the option to turn into males if need be

- Taking out one male and have next female change is less destructive to species than taking females
- No take of any male uhu from May to August. Do not decrease size limits based on perceived problems with the conservative size limit of palenose parrotfish. This will detrimentally affect the population of other species like panuhunuhu which require more time to reach maturity and does not make sense for conserving the resource – far better to overprotect these herbivorous fish than under protect and expose them to harvest prior to reaching maturity
- Make seasons for parrotfishes
- Uhu to be caught w/ spear or pole and line, not to be taken with nets
- Commercial take of parrot fish needs to be banned
- No commercial sale
- No commercial take and retail sale of parrotfish
- No sales
- Only sport and sustenance takes on Uhu
- Prohibit commercial sale and night spearing of parrotfish
- No night spearing of parrotfish
- No night spearing of Uhu (2-comments)
- Night spearing of parrot fish (and nearly all other fish genera) needs to be banned
- I would like to see a total ban on spearfishing with scuba gear. I would also like to see a ban on spear fishing at night. These are two "no-brainer" management measures that would be relatively easy to enforce and would limit the exploitation of certain resources, parrot fish in particular but also other species

Jacks (ulua/papio) regulations

Ulua Species	Max Size	L ₅₀	Existing Rule	Proposed Rule	% Agree	% Disagree
<i>Minimum Sizes</i>						
Kagami (<i>A. ciliaris</i>)	51.2”	26”-28”	-	10”	51	32
Other currently regulated spp.	17.8”-61.2”	14.7”-32”	10”	10”	60	26
<i>Bag Limits</i>						
Omilu (<i>C. melampygyus</i>)	32.7”	14.7”	-	No take >24”	27	53
All other regulated species			-	Combined limit of 5	46	39
All other regulated species			-	2/day>24”	40	43
<i>Other</i>						
Sportsfish designation	No commercial take of all regulated jack species. Note: Dobe, Butaguchi, Omaka, Paopao etc. not included – commercial take permitted				50	29
Note: Currently regulated jack species include White ulua (<i>C. ignobilis</i>), bluefin trevally (<i>C. melampygyus</i>), Black trevally (<i>C. lugubris</i>), Bigeye trevally (<i>C. sexfasciatus</i>), Barred jack (<i>C. ferdau</i>), Deepwater jack (<i>C. equula</i>) and Island jack (<i>C. orthogrammus</i>)						

Additional comments on these proposed ulua/papio regulations:

- The minimum size for Kagami and other regulated jacks should be L50 (26"-28" & 14.7"-32") instead of the proposed 10"
- Kagami min. size at least 28" if following L50
- Kagami: change proposed minimum size from 10" to 24"
- Kagami larger size of 16" and up
- Kagami min. size increase to 12"
- Kagami and other regulated species should increase to 12"
- Larger min. size for Kagami and other regulated jack species
- No take of Kagami
- There is no need to prohibit take of omilu greater than 24" fl as long as the bag limits are put in place. From my observation, fishing, and diving, the omilu seems to be doing the best in terms of sizes and abundance. The bag limit of 2 ulua over 24" for all species is more than adequate as long as it is enforced. Large size omilu are observed by myself and dive partners on almost every dive on the west

side of the big island, no matter where we go. I personally don't spear these fish anymore due to having 2 large omilu test positive for ciguatera. Additional measures to protect only omilu are not necessary.

- Bag limit on omilu > 24"
- 1 omilu > 24" per year
- A rule should be set for minimum size of omilu caught
- No take Omilu < 12"
- Agree with tags for > 24" and limits per year
- Allow traditional Hawaiian methods to catch ulua > 24"
- I catch jack species bottom fishing and jigging in water 150-300' deep. The sizes and limitations on numbers seem reasonable to me
- If you regulate these fish, you'll have more sports fishing from shore in the future. But what if they're eating all the weke, menpachi, etc.?
- Take size for all species should be increased to at least 12 in and bag limits for total/combined = 5 fish
- Bag limit 2 per day of any type of jack of any size > 10"
- L50 should be a minimum for all jack species
- Current regulated ulua species increase min. size to 12"
- Slot sizes should be in place for all jack species
- Slot limits are a good idea
- No slot restrictions
- No bag limits. Regulation should be based on L50
- Bag limit of 3 per day
- All other regulated species combination limit of three (3)
- Need maximum size limit on take
- No max size limits
- I believe this species should be caught in moderations only and not over fished. This is the only way to preserve this species
- Exempt traditional method of catching ulua from minimum size limit rules. (Kala'au/ma'ama'a)
- Separate ulua species for size limits, too much variation in L50
- 1 or 2 ulua per person per year.
- Regulated species > 24" allow 1 ulua per year
- Ulua fishing is my hobby and I think no commercial take is good

- No commercial sale of ulua, they are decreasing in numbers
- No commercial take of regulated Jack species and should not allow commercial take permit
- Size limit for commercial sales

Additional regulations may be proposed for the following fish species.

Species	Max Size	L ₅₀	Existing Rule	Proposed Rule	% Agree	% Disagree
Aweoweo (<i>Priacanthus spp.</i>)	Daily bag limit		-	5	31	52
Kala (<i>N. unicornis</i>)	Daily bag limit		-	2	37	33
Kole (<i>C. strigosus</i>)	Daily bag limit		-	20	48	36
Manini (<i>A. triostegus</i>)	10.6"	6.4"	5"	6"	43	38
Manini (<i>A. triostegus</i>)	Daily bag limit		-	20	49	38
Menpachi (<i>Myripristis spp.</i>)	Daily bag limit		-	20	38	44
Mu (<i>M. grandoculis</i>)	Daily bag limit		-	2	48	36
Pakuikui (<i>A. achilles</i>)	Daily bag limit		-	10	45	37

The following proposed regulations were only included on 31 West Hawai'i surveys.

Aholehole (<i>Kuhlia spp.</i>)	9.1"-9.5"	?	5"	-	55	32
Aholehole (<i>Kuhlia spp.</i>)	Daily bag limit		-	20	77	23
Moi (<i>P. sexfilis</i>)	19.6"	8.7"-13.6"	11"	12"	68	26
Moi (<i>P. sexfilis</i>)	Daily bag limit		15	5	71	26
Mu (<i>M. grandoculis</i>)	21.9"	14.3"	-	14"	74	23

Additional comments on these proposed additional species regulations:

- Paku'iku'i: change size limit to 5"
- Minimum size for paku'iku'i of 7"
- Bag limit for paku'iku'i of 5- not 10
- Paku'iku'i bag limit should be less than 10
- Daily paku'iku'i bag limit of 5
- Paku'iku'i and Kole daily limit of 50/person
- Kole and paku'iku'i L50 – 6"

- Paku'iku'i (*Achilles Tang/ Acanthurus Achilles*) are needed as food fish
- You can't penalize the commercial fishers for getting paku'iku'i as food fish, trop fishers are different
- Sympathize with commercial fishers and livelihood, but concerned about fish stocks numbers
- Maybe commercial fishers need special license with bag limits and catch reports
- Need recreational and commercial distinctions
- The bag limits are good to help ease commercial exploitation, and flat out greediness
- Kole: Slot limit of 5'' – 7''
- Kole bag limit should be less than 20
- Same size limit on manini for kole and paku'iku'i
- Manini size limit change to 8''
- Manini bag limit should be less than 20
- Manini bag limit to 10 (3 comments)
- Manini also love algae, Why not give them some more room to breathe: Increase min. size to 8'' and only allowed to take 10, that should be enough to fill your tummy
- Manini size limit: Leave at 5'': no bag limit for recreational fishing
- Manini should still be 5'' in size with no bag limit. Need these for recreational/subsistence fishing
- Manini bag limit: no bag limit for recreational fishing
- No bag limits for recreational fishing of manini and menpachi
- Mempachi, manini and kole daily bag limit of 10
- Mempachi bag limit to 10/day
- Menpachi: no bag limit for recreational fishing
- Hell No! to bag limits on menpachi and aweoweo
- Menpachi min. size of 7'' and bag limit of 50, wholehole should have bag limit of 50/day
- For menpachi and aweoweo, I see and catch so much that I don't think there is a problem. What about for luaus and parties the bag limit is not enough. Maybe put a size limit rule first
- Daily bag limit for aweoweo should be 10 not 5
- Aweoweo bag limit should be 20 person per day
- At least 30 aweoweo per night and at least 50 menpachi per night
- Increase bag limit of kole, paku'iku'i, manini, menpachi to maybe 30. 20 seems a little low for a party.
- Moi minimum size should remain @ 11''

- Increase Mu bag limit to 5
- Increase bag limit on Mu from 2 to 10
- Mu should not have a minimum size restriction. The mu is not in any danger of being over-fished due to its wariness and its habits. The daily bag limit of 2 will more than ensure perpetuation of the resource
- Need size limit, not bag limit for Mu hard to hook or spear
- Everything should be L50 size. Close Kona crab season longer because in Sept and Oct they still have eggs. Then open season to female and male. – no bag limit
- Any rule changes that will decrease take on these species
- Consider minimum size >L50
- They should have minimum size rule for all of these fishes. Should increase bag limit for Ka'u and Hamakua due to weather, shoreline excess, and abundance of fish
- A minimum size should be set for these fish also
- I prefer and tend to lean on size limits over bag limits. I believe that regulating by size limits will help keep from population stable
- Need maximum size limit on take
- Agree with size limits, but should increase bag limits
- Above bag limits and size limits should apply to tropical fish collectors
- Check which species grows the fastest, that's the one to take out more
- How are you going to control the undersize fishes you don't get a count on
- I would not like to see a daily take of anything
- Extend closed season on those regulated species to extend breeding periods.
- Apply closed seasons to all species
- Closed seasons for commercial
- Leave large fish alone, they are the reproducers
- Need to find out why fish getting scarce, need to review all aspects
- There are more species that need to be added
- The Hawaiian Giant Grouper, *Epinephelus lanceolatus*, should be accorded outright and complete protection
- Please add tako daily bag limit of 1
- Should also have bag limit on opihi and lobster
- Why not new rules on opihi and a'ama crabs

- No commercial sale of opihi
- Ban commercial sale of Opihi
- Change opihi min. size to max size of 1 ½" shell size
- What about akule, awa, o'io, palani,...? What about uouoa? Tako? Ula? These are all species of concern that have been over-harvested and would benefit from bag limits and commercial restrictions. Every food and commercial species that is not covered by this initiative will suffer as fishing pressure shifts from the species that are, so the more comprehensive the better.

General comments on the proposed species regulations:

- Remove invasive species taape and roi
- Remove invasive species such as roi and taape
- Do a program to rid us of taape and roi like Maui's fishing tournament
- Taape can be found from shallows to 600 ft. or more by fishers
- This fisher has seen schools of taape 20ft high
- Roi eats everything
- (Alien) and invasive species kill juvenile Kona crabs and other food for our fishes
- Stop the commercial divers
- Need control on limiting the commercial and aquarium fisherman - make bag limits for them. They have been raping our food source. Us shoreline recreational/sustenance fisherman have always respected the ecosystem and do not take more than we need for food.
- Stop commercial diving, limit tropical diving bag limit
- Ban commercial fishing
- Stop the tropical divers and commercial divers
- What about commercial aquarium fishes caught? There should be a limit on how much they take daily
- Regulation should include sale of aquarium fish
- Stop the tropical fish collection taking what we need for da ohana kau kau
- Stop tropical fishing on this (arrow to additional species)
- Limit tropical + weight limit
- Stop tropical diving or limit + commercial diving
- Stop the tropical fish collectors
- Ban tropical fish collection

- Regulate tropical fishing
- Recreational/sustenance fishing should not have bag limits
- Eliminate bag limits on all fish
- Please ban sale of speared fish. There is no rhyme or reason why anyone should be allowed to do this
- No sale of speared fish
- A better management tool, surely, would be to ban the sale of all speared fish (please, please ... it is so dang obvious!!)
- No SCUBA and night spear fishing
- No SCUBA spear fishing allowed
- SCUBA and night spear fishing should be regulated and cross net banned
- Need to establish permit process to limit # of fishers in a given area. You can have a bag limit but it will not be effective if the # of fishers increases. Recreational licensee with limited number of fishers.
- Install a fishing license program.
- There should be fishing licenses for non residents
- Recreational licenses which include consent to allow cooler inspection
- Make rules more strict and enforce them
- Will enforcement improve with new and existing rules
- Allow inspection of fisher's coolers and fish boxes by enforcement
- Enable enforcement to look in coolers
- Should have more DLNR officers patrolling Ka'u and Hamakua to enforce rules
- More education and better enforcement needed
- I think education is a good thing, but it won't solve the problem with the reef fish. I think it will take some pretty harsh regulations or we'll just watch them disappear
- Make violators be heavily fined or imprisoned (multi violators)
- Extensive MPAs, please. These should be permanent, and well-signposted, and ban all types of fishing for all people. They are relatively easy to establish ... all it takes is a willingness to be proactive, and not let people's individual greed override the common good
- Increase the number and size of reserve areas (MPAs). Scientific studies (including Bill Walsh's stellar work) have shown MPAs to be the single most effective tool for management of reef fishes. Why would we do otherwise?
- More no-take areas
- Stop all taking from the ocean

- No commercial sale of reef fish
- Commercial fishers should have same size and bag limit restrictions as recreational/subsistence fishers
- In troubled economy today, families need to fish and hunt to provide for themselves. DLNR restrictions will place hardship and stress on them
- Big fish have more offspring, ban fishing for species during spawning season
- Should do more research and have more input before setting rules upon Ka'u. Every district is different (weather, population etc.) every district should have own rules to follow
- No problems in Ka'u, no need regulations
- These rules should not apply to Ka'u which is governed by the weather
- Ka'u has abundant of these fish species when weather permitting
- These rules should consider area/location before application. Weather protects Ka'u from over fishing
- Rules not for Ka'u, cannot fish because of weather. Bag limits should not apply to Ka'u
- I agree with proposal, but should not apply to Ka'u
- Too much disrespect from outsiders in Ka'u
- Carlsmith and Richardson beach lagoons should be closed (Kapu) to two-five years, a moratorium on all fishing, spearing and netting to replenish areas
- Restriction based on area not for the whole state
- Need more time and input from east Hawaii populations
- Proposed rules do not reflect east Hawaii public responses
- DAR's studies and graphs are biased because they look at only the high use areas
- Ka'upulehu wants only their guests to use their ocean front area
- There are limitations made by owners of homes along the shore at Mauna Kea. What can be done? Locals are left out
- Public access to shoreline is a concern. There are more and more limited access areas
- Kanaka Maoli are protected from these fishing rules HAR 12, Sec 7 per the PASH litigation
- I oppose restrictions on our resources concerning native gathering rights under article 12, state of Hawaii constitution
- Let Hawaiians take HONU. (Two per family every six months)
- Make a lottery system for taking HONU. (so many a year, according to numbers)
- Should make lottery system for turtles
- Reduce the numbers of honu; they're overeating the limu and herbivorous fishes don't have enough food

- Should be allowed to start taking marine turtles
- Should consider management by Konohiki
- Need better public notice on these meetings
- Reduce development
- Your information is wrong. How can we help you? We must learn what fishers know
- Shame on DLNR killing horses, cattle, sheep and goats and leaving in the field
- Ask local fisherman for their input not tell them what you people know we do this every day
- Combine fisher observations with your research
- More information needed before giving full input of proposals (Seven persons gave same comment)
- Research should be done to look at the change in fishers' catch near the Kampachi fish cages
- Should add more fish ponds to grow more fish
- Outlaw fishing of all types in every ocean of the world. No one needs to eat fish. The oceans are becoming devoid of life with global warming. The coral will be next. Stop all fishing
- Start tag and release tournaments by using technology to measure on site and release
- Do something about tournaments, outsiders raid opihi, take illegal size and leave trash

Number of compiled questionnaires = 248. Self categorization as follows:

- a. Recreational ocean user **52%**
- b. Commercial ocean user **5%**
- c. Recreational/sustenance fisher **35%**
- d. Commercial fisher **3%**
- e. Other **6%**

Island of Hawai'i

Size & Bag Limit Proposed Rule Amendments

September 2010

Parrotfish (Uhu) regulations

Parrotfish Species	Common Name	L ₅₀	Existing Rule	Proposed Rule
Minimum Size				
Palukaluka/ Uhu 'ele'ele (<i>S. rubroviolaceus</i>)	Redlip Parrotfish	14"	12"	14"
Uhu 'ahu'ula/Uhu uliuli (<i>C. perspicillatus</i>)	Spectacled Parrotfish	14"	12"	14"
All other species		6"-12"	12"	10"
Bag Limit				
All species			-	2 (Total)
Uhu 'ele'ele (<i>S. rubroviolaceus</i>)	Redlip Parrotfish		-	No take of Blue males
Uhu uliuli (<i>C. perspicillatus</i>)	Spectacled Parrotfish		-	No take of Blue males

Goatfish Regulations

Goatfish Species	Common Name	L ₅₀	Existing Rule	Proposed Rule
Minimum Size				
Kumu (<i>P. porphyreus</i>)*	Whitesaddle Goatfish	10.4"-11.3"	10"	12"
Moano Kali (<i>P. cyclostomus</i>)	Blue Goatfish	11.4"	-	12"
Weke nono (<i>M. pflugeri</i>)	Pfluger's Goatfish	10.3"	-	12"
All Other goatfish		6.6"-7.9"	- or 7"	8"
Bag Limit				
Kumu (<i>P. porphyreus</i>)	Whitesaddle Goatfish		-	1
Moano Kali (<i>P. cyclostomus</i>)	Blue Goatfish		-	2
Munu (<i>P. insularis</i>)	Doublebar Goatfish		-	2
Weke nono (<i>M. pflugeri</i>)	Pfluger's Goatfish		-	5
Oama (= weke ≤5")			50	50 - Pole & Line Only

Jacks (ulua/p pio) regulations

Ulua Species	Common Name	L ₅₀	Existing Rule	Proposed Rule
Minimum Size				
Kagami (<i>A. ciliaris</i>)	African Pompano	26"-28"	-	10"
Bag Limit				
Omilu (<i>C. melampyrgus</i>)	Bluefin Trevally	14.7"	-	No take >24"
All other regulated Jacks			Combined Total of 20	Combined Total of 5
All other regulated Jacks			-	2/day>24"
Other				
Sportsfish designation	No commercial take of regulated jacks: White Ulua (<i>C. ignobilis</i>), Bluefin Trevally (<i>C. melampyrgus</i>), Black Trevally (<i>C. lugubris</i>), Bigeye Trevally (<i>C. sexfasciatus</i>), Barred Jack (<i>C. ferdau</i>), Deepwater Jack (<i>C. equula</i>) and Island Jack (<i>C. orthogrammus</i>)			

Other Species regulations

Species	Common Name	L ₅₀	Existing Rule	Proposed Rule
Minimum Size				
Aholehole (<i>Kuhlia</i> spp.)	Hawaiian Flagtail	?	5"	-
Manini (<i>A. triostegus</i>)	Convict Surgeonfish	6.4"	5"	6"
Moi (<i>P. sexfilis</i>)	Threadfin	8.7"-13.6"	11"	12"
Mu (<i>M. grandoculis</i>)	Bigeye Emperor	14.3"	-	14"
Bag Limit				
Aholehole (<i>Kuhlia</i> spp.)	Hawaiian Flagtail		-	20
Aweoweo (<i>Priacanthus</i> spp.)	Hawaii Bigeye		-	30
Kala (<i>N. unicornis</i>)	Bluespine Unicornfish		-	2
Kole (<i>C. strigosus</i>)	Goldring Surgeonfish		-	20*
* Within West Hi Regional Fisheries Management Area for AQ permit holders w/ CML there is no bag limit for kole ≤4" TL and a limit of 5 kole/day for fish >4"				
Manini (<i>A. triostegus</i>)	Convict Surgeonfish		-	20
Menpachi (<i>Myripristis</i> spp.)	Soldierfish		-	30**
** No bag limit for Menpachi taken by CML holders on hook and line				
Mu (<i>M. grandoculis</i>)	Bigeye Emperor		-	2
Moi (<i>P. sexfilis</i>)	Threadfin		15	5
Pakuikui (<i>A. achilles</i>)	Achilles Tang		-	10